Bear-baiting in Pakistan

Prepared by The World Society for the Protection of Animals
Executive summary

In 1993 WSPA's Libearty campaign initiated an investigation into bear baiting in Pakistan. The resulting report and footage of bear baiting events in Pakistan stimulated an international outcry which resulted in the Pakistani authorities agreeing to enforce the ban on these events. An investigation team sent to Pakistan documented the continuation of this practice in the state of Punjab during February 1997. The events seem to continue unabated despite government assurances that the ban remains intact. The influence of the national and regional government in these essentially rural areas is much diminished and the local landlords in these regions have considerable power and influence. It is with the patronage of local landowners that this practice seems to continue unpunished and in some cases with the co-operation of the local representatives of the police force and other government officials. Without support the Pakistani authorities will never have the manpower, resources or facilities to effectively enforce the ban on bear baiting events. What enforcement there has been has been targeted at the kalander and not the organisers and patrons of these events. A more holistic approach is required to secure a long term solution to this problem. The solution would include better enforcement of wildlife and animal protection laws, registration of bears, facilities to house confiscated animals. The approach would also include elements of public awareness and education, focusing on the religious implications in allowing these activities to proceed. The Pakistani government has been concerned over this matter and it is essential that we proceed collaboratively to achieve a long term end to bear baiting and alleviate the suffering of fighting bears in Pakistan.

The Legal Position In Pakistan

The act of baiting animals is banned by Pakistan legislature under the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act (1890).

The capture of bear cubs is prohibited under:

Summary of Recommendations

Law enforcement in itself has not been an effective means of ending this practice. It must be part of a more holistic approach to the problem. The Pakistani government needs support if it is to enforce the present legislation banning bear baiting events.
If the Pakistani Authorities:

- Establish a permanent officer within the Wildlife Department to ensure more effective enforcement of existing wildlife and welfare laws.

- Introduce the legal, moral and ethical arguments against bear baiting into the school curriculum in bear baiting zones.

- Produce and distribute public awareness materials in the bear baiting zones giving clear reasoning why bear baiting cannot be justified on legal, moral or religious grounds.

- Set up a bear registration scheme to monitor and stop further depletion of the remaining wild bears in Pakistan and to enable confiscation of bears involved in illegal bear baiting events.

- Invest in the low income Kalanders (gypsy) communities to raise their level of education, standards of living and assist in the re-training of Kalanders for alternative employment where necessary.

WSPA will:

- Set up a facility to house confiscated animals for life and without captive breeding. WSPA can construct such a facility but it will ultimately be the responsibility of the Pakistani government to oversee and ensure the long term welfare of these animals.

- Assist in the production of public awareness posters and other materials giving clear reasoning why bear baiting cannot be justified on moral or religious grounds.

- Seek to employ an Independent observer who will monitor the relevant areas for illegal baiting events.

- Offer assistance to the Pakistani authorities in the creation of a bear registration scheme to monitor and stop further depletion of the remaining wild bears in Pakistan and to enable confiscation of bears involved in illegal bear baiting events.

Background

Geography
Pakistan occupies about 887,700 sq. km, a third the size of India. Pakistan’s neighbours are Iran on the south-west, Afghanistan west and north, China on the north-east, India along the eastern border and the Arabian sea coast in the south. Topographically, Pakistan can be
divided into six regions.

The Northern Mountains - include the Hindu Kush and Karakoram range. It boasts the densest concentration of high peaks on earth.

The Northern Plateau which are the undulating lowlands at the feet of the mountains including the fertile Peshawar valley.

Western Mountains - From the Hindu Kush down through the tribal lands of the North West Frontier Province (NWFP) down to the scrubby Kirthar range in Baluchistan.

Baluchistan Plateau - Hilly parched, inhospitable plateau across western Baluchistan.

South-east Desert - From east of the Indus and southern Punjab this barren (Chloistan / Thar) desert reaches into Rajasthan in India.

Indus Plain - The alluvial plains of the Indus and its four tributaries (Jhelum, Chenab, Ravi and Sutlej). Punjab literally means five waters and is to be found at the heart of Pakistan, where most of its people live and most of the food is grown.

Pakistan is divided into four provinces (capitals in Parentheses) and further broken down into divisions.

**Punjab (Lahore):**
Rawalpindi, Sargodha, Faisalabad, Gujranwala, Lahore, Multan, Deri Ghazi Khan, Bahawlpur.

**Sind (Karachi):**
Hyderabad, Sukkur, Karachi

**North West Frontier Province-NWFP (Peshawar):**
Peshawar, Kohat, Hazara, Dera Ismail Khan, Malakand, Tribal Areas (autonomous).

**Baluchistan (Quetta):**
Quetta, Sibi, Kalat, Makran.

The Northern Areas and Azad Jammu & Kashmir are not provinces but federally administered regions.

The Northern Areas (Gilgit), Ghizar, Dianar, Skardu and Ghanche
Azad Jammu & Kashmir (Muzaffarabad) Bagh, Poonch, Kotli and Mirpur

(King & St. Vincent, 1993).
The Status of the Asiatic black bear (Ursus thibetanus) and Brown bear (Ursus arctos) in Pakistan.

Asiatic black bear status (Ursus thibetanus) - Once found throughout the dry mountain steppe forests to the west of the Indus River and across the mountainous region in the northern part of the country (Roberts, 1977). From 1930 to the present human activity has caused insularisation of small bear populations in various mountainous areas throughout the country (Servheen, 1990).

Capture of bears for use as performing animals is still quite common in Pakistan. Captive bears are taught to wrestle and dance for groups of ‘gypsies’ who earn their sole living from the bears. Bears are still persecuted in Pakistan by sport hunters and by people protecting their crops. This persecution has increased dramatically since the 1940’s due to the widespread ownership of firearms (Servheen, 1990).

Presently there is little information on the status of the Asiatic black bear in Pakistan but best estimates put the figure at less than a 1,000 individuals remaining in the wild. (Servheen pers comm, 1997).

A small isolated population in Baluchistan describes as sub-species Ursus thibetanus gedrosianus is listed in the IUCN Red Data Book. (Servheen, 1990)

Brown bear status (Ursus arctos) - The brown bear is uncommon in Pakistan in the few areas where it exists in the mountains of the north west along the Chinese border (Serhveen, 1990). Brown bears only remain in remote areas, the highest concentration being on the Deosai plains which may number 50 individuals (Morgan, correction to Servheen, 1990). This is thought to be the largest population of brown bears surviving in Pakistan, although there are reports of smaller, fragmented populations elsewhere; the nearest reported bears are about 200km from the Deosai and isolated by developments in the valley bottoms (Miller & Schwartz, 1996).

The History of Bear-baiting (‘Dungle’) in Pakistan

The gypsies (kalanders) traditionally danced their bears in return for alms. With British rule the habit of animal baiting was introduced into the Indian sub-continent. Bull terriers were imported and the gypsies were made to use their bears fight.

Feudal landlords in Punjab and Sindh were quick to pick up on the new ‘sport’. This helped to develop relations with the British rulers and establish their important status within the rural community. The sport became a regular event of winter festivals (November - April) in small pockets dominated by feudal landlords (Chaudry, 1994). There are some very isolated
pockets of bear baiting in NWFP and Balochistan but on the whole the game is virtually unknown in urban areas and rural regions outside the Punjab and Sindh.

The Legal Position In Pakistan
The act of baiting animals is banned by Pakistan legislature under the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act (1890).

The capture of bear cubs is prohibited under:

Religious Restrictions
It is related from Ibn Abbas that the Messenger of allah, may Allah bless him and grant him peace, forbade inciting animals to fight one another (transmitted by Abu Dawud and al-Tirmidhi).

The Main Sections of Society Involved in Bear baiting.
The Graziers are a migrating, pastoral people who live off their herd of sheep, goats, and a few cattle. They capture bears from the North West Frontier Province, Pakistan and also from Nooristan, Afghanistan.

The Traders are the middlemen who purchase the animals from the graziers and then sell them onto kalanders.

The Kalanders are traditionally nomadic gypsies. People say that they are they represent some of the original tribal peoples of the region. kalanders purchase the cub, extract the incisors and canine teeth and pierce the animals muzzle with a nose ring. This is to afford some control via the sensitive muzzle over the animal for the rest of its life. The animal is taught to dance by being beaten and the manipulation of the nose ring by the kalanders. Some kalanders are also encouraged by the landlords and the organisers to use their bears in bear baiting events.

The Landowners can vary in size from the very powerful land-barons to the landlords with just a small number of tenants. Local prominent businessmen also fall into this category. The landowners seem to have a lot of time on their hands and they turn to various activities to
pass the time. As with all walks of life some landlords have high ethical, moral and religious values which precludes their involvement in such events as bear baiting. Others however, are enthusiastic supporters of bear baiting. The largest and wealthiest landowners seem more interested in horse and greyhound racing. It is the small and medium size landlord who seems to see the baiting of bears with his dogs as an affirmation of his respected status within rural Pakistani culture.

**The Helpers** are usually tenants, servants or land-less labourers under the control of the local Landlord. These people care for the dogs on a daily basis and handle the animals during and after the event.

**The Audience** are mainly made up of youngsters and the older men with a fair number of the local landlords.

Chaudry indicated in his report that prior to the international outcry of 1993 there were 80 registered bear baiting events in Pakistan per year. He believed the total could be nearer 100+ events. He estimated an average of 10 bears at each event and therefore extrapolated that in 1992-93 that 2,400 bear baiting fights had taken place. (Chaudry, 1993).

**The Involvement of WSPA in bear-baiting in Pakistan.**

In 1993 WSPA and WWF (Pakistan) investigated and exposed the bear-baiting activities within the province of Punjab and Sindh. The international public outcry resulted in the Pakistani authorities taking the following steps:

- A statement by a Government spokesman dated December 9th 1993, Lahore indicated that the government had ordered all the provincial authorities to enforce a ban on bear-baiting, confiscate bears from gypsy (kalander) entertainers and shift them to zoological gardens.

- Inspector General of Forests, Government of Pakistan told Associated Press of Pakistan that bear-baiting not only contravened wildlife protection laws but violated Islamic injunctions. Central Government had therefore asked provincial governments of Punjab and North West Frontier Province to make suitable amendments in legislation if necessary to completely ban possession of bears and use them as performing animals. All bears should be confiscated from gypsies who pit their bears against dogs for entertainment or business.

- The Government of North West Frontier Province declared that a ban had been imposed on bear-baiting in the province and had also felt the necessity of establishing a park for captive bears and would welcome the sponsorship of international NGO’s.
A small number of cases were brought against offenders (kalanders) after the international outcry over this practice. However, bear baiting has continued in Pakistan and WSPA knows of no bear confiscations resulting from this order.

The Aims and Objectives of the Present Investigation

Aims:
WSPA received recent reports that the practice of bear-baiting in Pakistan was continuing unabated in the former areas in the Punjab and Sindh. The government authorities were unable or unwilling to enforce the legislation banning these events.

Methodology:
Mr. Inayat Ullah Chaudry of Habitat Integrated - Pakistan is presently one of the foremost authorities on bear baiting activities in Pakistan and is committed to seeing the end of these events and the conservation of the remaining bear populations in Pakistan. Since the statement by the Pakistani government of their intention to enforce the ban on bear baiting in 1993 Mr. Chaudry had kept WSPA informed of possible events. It soon became clear that such events, after an initial period of strict enforcement, the number of bear had slowly begun to rise again.

In January 1997 Mr. Chaudry indicated that a number of bear-baiting events had been advertised.

Dera Ismail Khan (NWFP) 10th February 1997.
Drema (district Sargodha) 10th February 1997. 125 miles from Lahore.
Miane-Khu (district Mianwali)12th February 1997. 200 miles from Lahore.
Chak 55 (district Sargodha)13th February 1997. 130 miles from Lahore - 10 bears fighting 30 dogs.

It was therefore decided that John Joseph (Regional Manager - Asia) and a (Freelance cameraman) would visit these previously identified areas within Sargodha and Mianwali districts to actually witness these events and attempt to document what is happening during these events. To also gather information from kalanders, landlords, local authorities, government representatives and religious authorities.

Dairy of events
10/2/97 Arrival Lahore.
11/2/97 Travel to Sargodha District. Visited the Drema festival. The festival had been brought forward by 3 days. There were many different events at this festival. We arrived on the last day of the event. The bear-baiting or ‘Dungle’ had taken place 3 days previously and the festival was in its closing stages with ‘tent-pegging’, a game of horsemanship involving the removal of a number of pegs in the ground by a rider armed with a long staff within a set time limit.

12/2/97 Tried to verify the other events. We received very garbled information. Some sources were suggesting that the police were enforcing the ban in the region. Another source indicated that one of the events (Mianwali) had definitely been cancelled due the death of the patron’s relation. Found no local unadvertised events. Interviewed a local kalander.

13/2/97 Found that the event at Chat 55 had also been cancelled. When we arrived there were many upset people expecting the event to go ahead. Since we were not being very successful, we decide to change approach and we tried to make contact with influential landowners who own the fighting dogs and may be aware of events. We also began to actively seek out kalanders and bears in the region. The landlords verbally confirmed an event on the 20th February in Mithatiwana Village.

14/2/97 Since we did not have any confirmed reports of events we decided to return to Lahore via another bear-baiting zone (Jheng). We found two posters confirming one event on the 20th February 1997 (Kotla Fateh Khan) and another on the 21st February 1997(Jeewna Karona).

15/2/97 Decided to extend the duration of the visit in order to confirm the presence of these events.

16/2/97 Interviewed Imran Khan

17/2/97 Interviewed Dr. Israr Ahmad (one of the top 5 religious leaders in Pakistan). Finalised plans for travel back into the region.

18/2/97 Travel from Lahore to Shahpur which would be our base for the next 4 days. Confirmed the event (Kotla Fateh Khan) on the 20/2/97. We contacted the organiser for this event who informed us that there would be at least 5 bears and the dog owners would be competing for a prestigious cup. This was a rural area and the chances of attracting trouble was less.

19/2/97 Confirmed the event Mithatiwana Village 20/2/97. Since both the above events were on the same day, it was decided that we would attend the function at Mithatiwana.
since it seemed larger although all confirmation was verbally conveyed and there was no poster for this event. It was also the more risky of the two options on this day.

20/2/97 Attended the event as planned. There were 6 Asiatic black bears and 50 fighting dogs.

21/2/97 Drove through the second event, made contact with the organiser and was promptly invited as guest to the (Jeewna Karona) event. There were 12 bears of which 7 had fought at the time of departure. Back to Lahore.

22/2/97 Left Pakistan via Karachi.

**Interview with kalander - Zafar Faqir  12/2/97**  
Bear name: Kalashnikov
Kalashnikov is a 5 year old Asiatic black bear. He had been in a fight at the Derma event 4 days previously. Inspection revealed some bad lesions around the ears caused by the fight. The bear was still extremely sensitive in this region and would not allow any touching of the ears and forehead. His canines and incisors had been removed as a cub. His molars were still present. His claws were intact and relatively sharp. His owner explained that the bear had fought well during the ‘dungle’. There was considerable recent scarring around the muzzle, but there were no recent injuries to compliment the injury to the ears. The owner had received 600 rupees (£12 approx.) for fighting his bear.

**Interview with kalander - Mr. Nawaz  13/2/97**  
Bear name: Mahabali
Mahabali was a 4 year old Asiatic black bear. He had been bought as a cub for approximately 60,000 Rupees (£100). The bear was yet to compete in a bear baiting event, but was being built up for the ring. The animal was in good condition. The incisors and the canines had been removed as a cub and only the molars remained. The nose ring was causing some discomfort and was clearly bleeding. The kalander was rough with the animal and as yet not too confident. The animal was clearly distressed with all the attention it was receiving and the rather rough treatment of the kalander. We approached cautiously. He has a clear scar on the left side of the muzzle indicating some previous nose ring which had to be removed and replaced at its present position. He indicated that all these nose rings are pierced without any anaesthetic.

The bear had all its claws and the owners hoped it would make a formidable fighting bear. He was in relatively good condition. The kalander mentioned that the bear could be valued at 100,000 Rupees (£1,600) if it gained a reputation as a good fighting bear. The kalander also

---

**The World Society for the Protection of Animals**
mentioned an undiagnosed illness in recent years. The kalander indicated that he had lost his last 5 bears to this illness over the last 7 years. The symptoms included lethargy, diarrhoea, loss of appetite and after a period of up to a month, death. He was particularly suspicious of our intentions and we had to make considerable efforts to pacify their fears. He indicated that the ban had hurt their business, but not as much as the loss of good animals.

The kalander was quite wealthy by gypsy standards (he owned his own building rather than a tent which was more common with kalanders). When questioned about his relative prosperity he indicated that the loan for the building of his basic habitation was secured from a local landowner. Since he owned no land, he would have to beg at the house of local landowners to get money, feed for his animals and for his bear. The begging took the form of laying his bear prostrate at the feet of his ‘patron’, which gives the landowner ‘pleasure’ subsequently, the generosity of the landowners’ gifts increases.

Interview with Landowner - Mr. Zafar Bhatti 13/2/97

Upon making our acquaintance with this landlord, we noticed the presence of 3 ‘bull terrier’ class dogs. We asked him about his dogs and he explained that they were a mix of imported Bull terriers and a local breed (kohati). He explained that the imported animals were usually more intelligent, but the local breeds had more stamina. He confirmed that he used his dogs for fighting and one animal did have the tell-tale marks around the muzzle. We were informed that the animals were very valuable and could command prices of 100,000 Rupees (£1,600). He also owned a pointer which he used for hunting (another popular pastime with landlords). He also had a number of fighting cocks.

He informed us that there would be an event on the 20th February 1997 (Mithatiwana) and that some local dignitaries would be attending. He knew about the ban on bear baiting events, however, he assured us that he could bait bears with his dogs with impunity.

Haq Nawaz - is the largest bear owner in the region. His family informed us that they had lost 7 bears (including a very famous brown bear) in the last 5 years. They described the same symptoms as the previous kalander including its terminal nature. He showed us the graves of his most recent casualties He presently owned a cub and a larger male of approximately 1.5 years of age.

The Participants

**Asiatic Black Bear (Ursus thibetanus):** medium sized bear found from Iran to Japan. 1.4 to 1.7 metres head to tail and the males weigh up to 120 kg. The coat is long, jet black with a purplish sheen. White crescent on chest, some white on chin. Can live 24 years in the wild.
They may seek out cultivated crops or domestic livestock but tend to avoid human contact (Macdonald, 1984).

**Bull Terrier:** Quite fearless medium sized terrier with athletic prowess due to crossbreeding between bulldogs and lighter terriers. At a later stage some Dalmatian blood was introduced. The strong head should be deep and long to the end of the muzzle. The eyes narrow and rather obliquely placed. Colour is pure white or coloured (Henderson, 1980).

**Cross-bred Terrier:** A stronger jaw-line, larger, more muscular than the bull terrier and more pitbull in appearance. White-Coloured often with mottling. These animals seem more ferocious in the attack and less discriminating.

**Rules of the Game**

Bear baiting or ‘Dungle’ (wrestling - Punjabi)

A bear is tethered to a central pivot by a rope of variable length (2-5metres). Two Bull Terriers are set on the tethered bear. The dogs must elicit a roll from the bear. This is usually done by the dogs targeting the sensitive muzzle, tongue and chin, the ears are also attacked frequently. If the dog can attach himself to one of these sensitive areas he can then proceed to pull the bear down and roll the larger animal. This would mark the successful conclusion of the fight in the favour of the dogs.

The bear will ultimately have to defend itself against the attacks of the two dogs. It will be declared the winner if the dog or the dog owner decides that they have taken enough punishment and the bear remains on his feet and has not been rolled by the animal. There is a points system based on the levels of submission of the bear achieved by the attacking pair of dogs.

**Location:** Mithatiwana Village, Near Hospital.
**Date:** Thursday 20th February 1997
**Organiser:** Amir the Butcher.
**Arena:** 60 metres square approximately.
**Audience:** Approximately 2,500

We arrived around 9.00am. We had viewed the site the day before, it was just some open land adjacent to a local hospital, but the transformation was considerable. The circular cloth perimeter had been erected, limiting access to a small narrow funnel protruding from the cloth perimeter. A sound system running off some car batteries was blaring around the ground. The kalanders had arrived but were elsewhere at the moment, probably at the house.
of the organiser. A number of dogs were found around outside the fabric-lined arena.

We were informed that the event would not begin until midday. Around midday we were further informed that the event would not begin until after 1.00pm. The reason was obvious, a large number of schoolchildren and students, who were at school in the morning were paying their 10 rupees entrance fee and were eagerly awaiting the first fight. Approximately half the crowd were made up of males under 21 years of age. There were musicians keeping the crowd entertained until the first fight at 1.30pm. The crowd created a perimeter of a approximately 30 metres from the centre of the arena.

The bears were held in one area and were fairly relaxed with their owners. They were all laying down in a little shade but without access to water. Whilst some of the dogs near the bears were agitated, generally the bears aroused little interest in the dogs at this stage. There were nine bears both male and female at the event but observations indicate that mainly the males were fought. Only male dogs were pitched against the bears. There were six bears involved in fights.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bear No.</th>
<th>No. of Pairs of Dogs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total 6 Bears 25 fights

All of the dogs can be described as Bull terrier or Cross bred fighting dog class. Males from the same litter were commonly used as pairs. The dogs were let off in two different ways. Usually the animals were let off together as a pair. Occasionally the dogs would be set off from different directions. If the bear has performed well the dog owners were more likely to let their dogs go from different positions. The dogs in the fight and amongst the audience are completely focused on the bear and on several occasions the thrill of a fight for the dogs spills over to other animals who would lose their leashes and join in on the attack on the bear. Several times during the course of the event a dog would break from the crowd and head for the tethered bear with people trying to stop the animal, but at the same time very wary of their frenzied state of the dog.

Four of the bears gave indications that they had been fought before. They carried some visible scars. One of the smaller bears was a female and the other was a juvenile who had not
been in the ring before. Of the more experienced bears there seemed to be initially a period of trying to deflect the attacks of the dogs away by manoeuvring. However, it was almost inevitable that the bears would at some stage turn to face his aggressors. Once at this stage the bear would follow two possible courses of action. The larger animals would rise up on their hind legs and try and beat down the dogs with their clawed paws. The smaller bears would tuck their head behind their fore-paws, thereby protecting the muzzle and thrash out from this defensive position. This second tactic seemed to be easier on the sensitive muzzle of the animal but the ears get badly torn. The second tactic was also apparently more successful, but less popular with the crowd. The juvenile bear (No. 5) was completely unaware of its predicament until it was too late, hence the contest was a short one with the dogs securing an easy victory. It actually took more time to loosen the hold of the dogs after the bout.

The varying number of attacks on each bear gave an indication of the success of the bear. If it was successful more dogs were set on the bear. None of the bears were allowed to remain undefeated. Each bout lasted no longer than a two minutes, although the dogs’ jaws had to be levered off their hold on the bear with a bamboo staff carried by the kalander. Dragging the dogs away from the bear took approximately a minute in itself. It was at this time that the attack dogs or other dogs would return or join the attack on the tethered bear. Between the bouts the kalander would spit some water onto the muzzle of the bear to remove any blood and prepare the animal for the next bout. The gap between the bouts varied but were approximately spaced 2-3 minutes apart. No treatment for the injuries sustained by the bears, apart from the dousing of water on to wounds, was undertaken at the event itself. There was more concern for the injuries to the dogs but again treatment was minimal during the event although iodine solution was still visible on recent scars on some dogs. Closer examination of the claws of the bears indicated that they were blunt. The cause could not be ascertained, however, reducing the potential harm to the dogs seemed the most plausible.

If the attacking pair of dogs manage to roll the bear to the satisfaction of the referee, who would dance a little jig and run to reclaim their animals. Music would accompany the victors back to the boundary of the ring. The crowd would cheer loudly any successful ‘rolls’ completed by the pair of dogs. The victory of the bear or the refusal to fight of any dogs were greeted with howls of derision. The event ended at 3.45pm and the crowd, bears and dogs rapidly dispersed. The kalanders took their animals to the houseyard of the organiser who prepared a meal for the bear-owner and some chapattis and water for the bears including water. It was now almost 5.00pm
Location: Jeewna Karona (Darbar Pirshah)
Date: Friday 21st February 1997
Organiser: Saleh Mohammed, Nawab Allah Busi, Goldsmith of Sundrana Bhatan.
Arena: 40 metres diameter
Audience: Approximately 2,500

The arena was smaller at this event but the dog competitors were participating for a cup and a cash prize (2,000 rupees). It was better organised with three police officers maintaining order at the door and a number of honoured guests sitting under a tarpaulin on seats. A few of the guests had armed bodyguards. The entrance fee was 20 Rupees. The bears were ‘danced’ before the crowd to the excitement of the audience and the large number of dogs at the ring side.

There were 12 bears at the event and large numbers of dogs. There were so many dogs that the referee had to draw lots to see which pairs would ‘wrestle’ with the bears. We did not stay to the end of this event but it began at approximately 1.45pm. We left at 3.45pm. During this time seven bears had been fought.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bear No.</th>
<th>Pairs of Dogs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>7 bears</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>24 fights</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The bears were larger at this event and one bear had been in many fights before. His nose had been bitten away to almost the bone and there was considerable scar tissue which was bitten off by the first pair of dogs leading to profuse bleeding. He fought well however (using the standing technique) and had to endure a further 3 attacks. Upon the end of the attacks the kalander was trying to place the loop in the severely damaged nose of the animal. The extreme sensitivity of the area caused the bear to rear up and attack (the cameraman) who was slightly injured. It was indicated to me that one of the other bears (a female) was the champion bear at this event last year. The smaller animal protected her muzzle by placing it close to the ground and protecting herself with her paws with which she used to pin down dogs. She had to withstand three attacks before she was beaten. Then a further humiliating final attack by which time she looked exhausted. The fights were generally longer at this
event due to the better condition (generally) and the greater experience of the bears of these events. The dogs were also of a variable quality and this seemed to lead to longer bouts. This was to the detriment of the bear who had to face numerous attacks in rapid succession before being finally replaced at the centre of the ring.

Many of the other aspects were the same as the previous event, but generally better organised.

**Discussions & Recommendations**

The continuation of bear baiting events in Pakistan is due to a number of factors. As a result of the international condemnation of these practices in 1993-4, the Pakistani government made a number of public statements effectively banning the practice of bear baiting. The present investigation clearly shows that these events continue and receive patronage from the local landlords and in some cases the local police. This is as a result of two influences;

- The power of the local landowners / organisers and patrons.
- The lack of the resources and the will of the national and local government (Punjab, Sindh) to eradicate this practice.

The influence of the landlords also extends to the kalanders whom the landlords seem to support in terms of fodder, cash and even loans for their bears and property. In return for this patronage the landlord seems to exert considerable influence over the kalander and his bear. Landlords we met with an interest in bear baiting were willing to organise a private event to show off their dogs at short notice. This indicated easy access of the landlord to bears and the co-operation of the kalander. They also had considerable interest in other blood sports such as cockfighting and hunting. Many landlords also owned hunting dogs. Some of the more influential landlords were more interested in racing of dogs and horses than bear baiting.

The landlords would not take any notice of public awareness campaigns aimed at changing their lifestyle. They are, however, proud people and would certainly take note of public opinion if it exposed the cruel nature of the activity and ridiculed the involvement of landlords in these activities.

The kalanders dance a bear in return for money in public places and at special events such as weddings. The bears are also used to win favour with local landlords and in return the kalanders are requested to make their bears available for fighting. The incentive is 700 Rupees approximately which the kalanders get to take their bears to such events. Keeping in with the landlords could also prove beneficial in terms of additional financial support and fodder directly improving the status of the kalander. The tradition is passed down through the family in lieu of a formal education which most of the kalander families cannot afford.
The tradition is strong and the kalanders were very defensive towards the practice of dancing and bear baiting. The male head of the family usually a son of the patriarch maintained and trained the animal although other, younger family members and related family may also have access and use of the bear. Amongst the general public the general consensus was that all the kalanders were drug addicts and the money obtained from bear baiting was used to feed their habits. This was plainly not true with the kalanders we met. They had large families and spent considerable resources on their animal, maintaining their health and treating the animals after fights.

There is an illegality in the capture, training and performance of bears for dancing. The practice of bear baiting is also illegal. The Pakistani authorities have always claimed that there would be problems with enforcement. The government officers in the rural districts are very much under control of the local landlords. They do not have the power or the standing within the local community to impose restrictions on the activities of the landlord.

The kalanders really are on the edge of poverty. Their bears are the main source of income and without them their families would face considerable hardship. They urgently require government assistance to encourage education and re-training for appropriate employment.

The government requires assistance in helping to enforce their present laws. The first priority is to set up a sanctuary for the Pakistani authorities to confiscate bears. A registration scheme also needs to be set up for the bears already in captivity. If the microchip system is used a close track can be kept on all the animals in captivity. No new animals should be allowed and any bears that have been fought or are unregistered should be confiscated by the Pakistani authorities and placed in suitable holding facilities for the rest of their lives. There may also be a precedent to update national and regional laws to focus specifically on this issue and to eradicate bear baiting from these zones in Pakistan.

The general public are predominately Muslim. The Islamic tenants specifically forbids the baiting of animals. Unfortunately Islamic tenants are the responsibility of the local religious ‘mullahs’. These religious leaders have gained their important position within the community by memorising the Koran and other religious texts verbatim. However, they have had to learn the Islamic regulations in Arabic and therefore they do not understand what they have learnt. They have some knowledge of the basic moral codes but bringing their attention to the relevant tenants could have a significant impact on public attendance at these events. The landowners involved in these activities, however, tend not to take much notice of religious edicts.

The large number of schoolchildren present at the events indicate that a public awareness and education campaign should be targeted at school and college students to dissuade them from attending such events.
The general public sit well back from the action (10-15 metres) from this position it is easy to believe that the event is harmless as befits its local name as a wrestling match. The general impression of the people attending was that it was a harmless pastime in an area where there is not much in the way of entertainment. Some acknowledged that the event may be cruel to the tethered bears, but were quick to say that very rarely were the animals fatally injured by combat. However, if they were to get a closer view I am sure some of the younger participants would see the event differently. The interest of these people needs to be diverted into other activities.

Outside the event there was much more dissension about the practice and a greater acknowledgement of the cruel nature of the sport. They were not fervent however, almost resigned to the fact that this had become part of rural Pakistani culture.

**Recommendations**

**Enforcement** - The Pakistani government needs support if it is to enforce the present conservation and welfare legislation banning bear baiting events. On the ground the wishes of the national and regional governments is not being translated into an effective enforcement policy. The authorities should be given support in provision of manpower (Wildlife Welfare Officer) and access should be provided to suitable resources such as microchipping, tattooing and freeze branding. A bear registration scheme should be implemented to monitor and stop further depletion of the remaining wild bears in Pakistan and to enable confiscation of bears involved in illegal bear baiting events.

A facility should be set up to house the confiscated bears for life and without captive breeding. WSPA can construct the facility but it will ultimately be the responsibility of the Pakistani government to oversee the long term welfare of these animals.

Enforcement in itself is not an effective means of ending this practice. It must be part of a more holistic approach to the problem.

**Public awareness** - Must be the corner stone of any co-ordinated approach to ending this practice. The moral and ethical arguments against bear baiting must be introduced into the school curriculum in these regions. Public awareness posters and other materials are also required in the regions to give clear reasoning why it is not morally or religiously right to patronise these events.

If the campaign had a local focus it would be more successful if local people were actively involved. The aim of such a public campaign would be to belittle the macho image of the sport and dent the egos of the landowners who support the continuation of such events. The
religious angle may prove effective in generating public opposition to these events.

**Training** - the Pakistani authorities must be encouraged to invest in the kalander communities to raise their level of education, standards of living and assist in re-training the kalanders for more appropriate employment where necessary. Through self betterment the kalanders can once and for all break the links with the local landowners and begin to make their own way in society.

**Useful Contacts**

Inayat Ullah Chaudry  
Habitat Integrated  
60 Fruit Market Kot Lakhpat  
Lahore  
Pakistan  
00 92 42 757 3647

Imran Khan / Fiaz Ahmad  
Pakistan Telseek -e-Insuf  
205, Scotch Corner  
Upper Mall  
Lahore  
Tel:  5713285-6  
Tel:  5713387 / 5711414

Dr. Israr Ahmad  
36-k, Model Town  
Lahore  
Tel:  5869501-3  
Res:  5834249

Mr. Aziz Aslam Khah  
Director General - Wildlife  
2, Sanda Road  
Lahore  
Pakistan
Bibliography


Source: Chaudry (1994).